

**NATIONAL CENTER FOR PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION QUALITY ASSURANCE
FOUNDATION**



**EXPERT PANEL REPORT
INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF
TAVUSH STATE REGIONAL COLLEGE**

Yerevan – 2022

INTRODUCTION

Institutional accreditation of Tavush State Regional College (hereinafter referred to as TSRC) was carried out according to the application submitted by the institution.

The process of institutional accreditation was organized and coordinated by the National Centre for Professional Education Quality Assurance Foundation (ANQA). ANQA was guided by the regulation on “State Accreditation of RA Institutions and their Educational Programs” set by the RA Government on 30 June, 2011 in N978 decree as well as by N959-Ն (30 June, 2011) decree on approving RA Standards for Professional Education Accreditation.

The expertise was carried out by the expert panel formed according to the requirements of ANQA Regulation on the Formation of the Expert Panel. The expert panel consisted of 4 local experts one of which is a student.

The process of accreditation was funded by the RA Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sport (Ministry of ESCS)

Institutional accreditation aims not only at the external evaluation of quality assurance but also to the continuous improvement of the institution’s management and quality of academic programs (APs). The cooperation of the institution with the employers and its influence on the content of education was especially highlighted.

The current report includes the results of the evaluation of TSRC's institutional capacities according to the RA state criteria and standards for accreditation.

CONTENT

INTRODUCTION	2
SUMMARY OF THE EVALUATION	4
PEER-REVIEW OF INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITIES ACCORDING TO THE RA STATE ACCREDITATION CRITERIA	4
DESCRIPTION OF EXTERNAL REVIEW	9
COMPOSITION OF THE EXPERT PANEL	9
THE PROCESS OF EXTERNAL REVIEW	9
EVALUATION ACCORDING TO ACCREDITATION CRITERIA	13
BRIEF INFORMATION ABOUT THE EDUCATION INSTITUTION	13
I. MISSION AND PURPOSES	15
II. GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	17
III. ACADEMIC PROGRAMS	20
IV. STUDENTS	26
V. FACULTY AND STAFF	28
VI. RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT	33
VII. INFRASTRUCTURE AND RESOURCES	35
VIII. SOCIETAL RESPONSIBILITY	39
IX. EXTERNAL RELATIONS AND INTERNATIONALIZATION	40
X. INTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM	42
ASSESSMENT ACCORDING TO ACCREDITATION CRITERIA	44
APPENDIX 1. CVs OF EXPERT PANEL MEMBERS	45
APPENDIX 2. TIME-SCHEDULE OF SITE-VISIT	46
APPENDIX 3. LIST OF THE DOCUMENTS OBSERVED	47
APPENDIX 4. RESOURCES OBSERVED	49
APPENDIX 5. ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE	50
APPENDIX 6. USED ABBREVIATIONS	51

SUMMARY OF THE EVALUATION

PEER-REVIEW OF INSTITUTIONAL CAPACITIES ACCORDING TO THE RA STATE ACCREDITATION CRITERIA

The expertise of TSRC was carried out by the independent expert panel formed according to the requirements of ANQA Regulation on the Formation of the Expert Panel¹. The evaluation was carried out according to the 10 criteria set by the RA Government on 30 June 2011 N 959–Ն decree.

While carrying out the evaluation the expert panel took into consideration that TSRC is a regional vocational education institution the aim of which is "with the introduction of advanced concepts and technologies, the implementation of traditional, as well as innovative, experimental programs and the formation of a network system created by the inclusion of various organizations, including educational institutions, to become a multi-functional center of excellence for the development of the RA vocational education system and the region, taking on the role of a leader and promoter of educational reforms, ensuring the training of qualified professionals in accordance with the personal requirements and those of the labor market".

The fact that the TSRC is a regional college which is located in Ijevan and has an important strategic value was also taken into consideration. Besides, TSRC is undergoing an institutional accreditation for the first time.

TRSC provides mainly demanded and innovative professions. The academic programs of "Tourism" and "Technical Maintenance and Repair of Automobile Transport" are carried out in a dual mode.

Recently, the professions of "Installation, Repair and Maintenance of Renewable Energy Power Plants" and "Winemaking and Juice Production" have been introduced. "Pre-school Education" and "Finance" are the professions that are difficult to realize in the labor market, and the stakeholders have different ideas about their place in the labor market regarding the profession "Organization of Transportation and Transport Management". When introducing professions, there is a labor market study at the oral level, but comprehensive analyzes are not available.

The college has reliable employers-partners who support TSRC in organizing internship and implementing practical lessons which is one of the strong points of the college. The management system lacks short-term and mid-term planning, which will clearly ensure the full implementation of the Concept of Development, the scope of cooperation of subdivisions is not visible. Decision-making is not based on reliable data, decisions are mainly made based on the situation. The participation of internal stakeholders in the management process is weak.

Through various subdivisions and links, TSRC provides support to students for solving problems that arise in the educational process, but not all mechanisms are coordinated, often students have a problem of awareness of their rights and responsibilities.

¹ Appendix 1: CVs of the expert panel members

Both skilled teachers with long-term work experience and young personnel work at the college. Young professors are mainly from the theoretical field, there is a problem of improving professors.

In the field of research, TSRC does not have specific objectives, the connection between research and learning is weak. Assignments of some modules contain elements that develop independent thinking, there are lecturers who are authors of professional manuals, have participated in the revision processes of the State Education Standards but the mechanisms for encouraging such positive experience are missing, which is one of the weaknesses of TSRC.

The college has the material and technical base necessary for the implementation of the educational programs of the professions, but most of them are not used in the educational environment, which is the main problem of the College. When replenishing the resource base, the needs of the region and beneficiaries were not always taken into account. Identifying the needs of internal stakeholders and replenishing the corresponding resource base are still incomplete. One of the major weaknesses of the College is the inefficient use of the existing resource base.

External accountability is mainly due to the submission of reports to the RA Governmental departments. A number of internal accountability mechanisms are in place, but there is a need to improve the mechanisms by forming an analytical accountability system. There are certain mechanisms in the field of social responsibility, but there is a need to create new ones and improve the existing ones.

TSRC cooperates with a number of regional organizations that help to create a favorable educational environment. The college also cooperates with a number of local and international charity organizations.

QA processes are still missing in TSCR. The main staff is not filled with an internal QA employee. The College has tried to create a documentary basis for QA processes, but its implementation is in danger, because work in this direction is still not being carried out.

Strengths of the College are:

1. Clear understanding of directions of the development of the College by the management of TSRC.
2. Steps towards employer-college active cooperation.
3. Active involvement of employers in the the development and revision of academic programs implemented in dual format.
4. Clarification of goals aimed at the formation of extra-budget.
5. The policy of selecting teaching and teaching support staff, ensuring the involvement of qualified personnel,
6. Mechanisms of applicant recruitment aimed at ensuring a stable flow of applicants,
7. Availability of a rich resource base,
8. A safe and secure environment for organizing the educational process,

9. The mechanisms of finding local and international partner organizations, ensuring the enrichment of the resource base.

Weaknesses of the College are:

1. Passive involvement of internal and external stakeholders in strategic planning.
2. Lack of systematic analysis in the basis of managerial decisions, as well as the absence of the PDCA cycle in the processes.
3. Lack of alumni with practical skills in line with employers' needs.
4. Imperfection of mechanisms of correlation of teaching, learning and assessment methods.
5. Absence of policy of the monitoring of APs.
6. Incompleteness of steps aimed at the improvement of lecturers.
7. Scarcity of employer-lecturers.
8. Lack of ambitions and encouraging approaches in the field of research.
9. Imperfection of the link between research and teaching.
10. Inactive cooperation with other VET institutions.
11. Absence of IQA system.

Main recommendations.

Mission and Purposes

1. To develop and introduce mechanisms revealing the needs of internal and external stakeholders.
2. To carry out analysis of the needs of stakeholders, region and the peculiarities of the College and to review the mission, goals and objectives of the College ensuring clarity and tangibility.
3. To develop a plan-schedule for the implementation of strategic goals and objectives clarifying the responsible people and defining indicators for the evaluation of effectiveness.
4. To develop and introduce toolkit for the regular evaluation and improvement of SP for making it continuously updated and applicable.

Governance and Administration

5. To ensure planning and implementation of mid-term and short-term goals.
6. To develop and introduce job descriptions for all units and positions ensuring clear functions of everyone.
7. To provide reliable data analysis of the study of internal and external factors, which will become the basis for decision-making.
8. To ensure full implementation of PDCA cycle in all levels of the University.

Academic Programs

9. To carry out an in-depth and systematic analysis of the labor market, taking into account the characteristics of the region and the College. When introducing new professions or revising existing ones, rely on these analyses.
10. To develop and implement policies and procedures on the Review and Monitoring of APs.

11. To diversify the assignments given to students within the modules, which will be aimed not only at testing knowledge, but also skills and competences.
12. To invest active efforts to make more educational programs dual.

Students

13. To activate the activities of the members of the SC by clarifying the functions and the work performed by them.
14. To activate the work of the Career Center by matching the topics of informal courses according to professions, to make frequent meetings with employers and successful graduates.
15. To ensure the involvement of students in various research projects.

Faculty and Staff

16. To introduce mechanisms for the involvement of employer-lecturers, as well as to cooperate with employers in the direction of implementing programs to improve the professional qualities of the teaching staff.
17. To ensure professional training of the teaching staff by carrying out program raising activities.
18. To develop and implement clear mechanisms for evaluation and encouragement of teaching staff.

Research and Development

19. To develop, introduce and implement a policy encouraging the research works of the lecturers.
20. To introduce mechanisms for the dissemination of best practices in the field of research.
21. To develop and implement research-based assignments given to students, which will contribute to the development of students' analytical and creative thinking, will be derived from the AP LOs and the requirements of NQF.

Infrastructure and Resources

22. To develop and introduce mechanisms for revealing the needs of the stakeholders, ensuring the acquisition of resources arising from the needs.
23. To put strategic priorities in the basis of financial planning.
24. To develop mechanisms for full and effective use of resources appropriate to the existing educational environment.

Societal Responsibility

25. To provide unified system of internal accountability ensuring analysis and link to the SP.
26. To introduce mechanisms of dissemination of information and feedback by activating the Facebook page, website implementation works, ensuring the transparency of the processes of the College.
27. To introduce and implement short-term courses for different target groups.

External Relations and Internationalization

28. To provide institutional mechanisms for establishing external relations, coordinating and documenting legal relations with partners.
29. To expand cooperation with the RA colleges, particularly those with such similar APs, ensuring the exchange of experience of teaching staff.
30. To improve the level of knowledge of a foreign language (Russian, English) of teaching staff and students.

Internal Quality Assurance System

31. To fill the position of internal quality assurance officer with an experienced and flexible employee.
32. To provide appropriate training for the newly appointed IQA officer in order to plan and implement quality assurance processes in a targeted way.
33. To develop and implement reliable mechanisms of data collection, analysis and dissemination involving internal and external stakeholders.
34. To conduct a systemic analysis to understand the priorities of the IQA department and plan current activities according to the revealed priorities.



Kristine Hakobyan, Head of the Expert Panel

29.12.2021

DESCRIPTION OF EXTERNAL REVIEW

COMPOSITION OF THE EXPERT PANEL

External evaluation of TSRC institutional capacities was carried out by the following expert group members:

1. **Kristine Hakobyan** -Head of the HR of Kotayq State Regionl College of the RA, Lecturer of Tourism,
2. **Alvina Nersisyan**- Head of the IQA Center of Mesrop Mashtots University, Republic of Artsakh, Lecturer at the Chair of Foreign Languages,
3. **Lianna Grigoryan**- Lecture at the Chair of Economics and Autoprofessional Subjects at Artik State College of the RA
4. **Henrik Poghosyan** -Student of the profession of Accounting at Ararat State Regional College of the RA

The composition of the expert panel was agreed upon with the College. The work of the expert panel was coordinated by the Specialist at the Department of ANQA Institutional and Program Accreditation Anahit Terteryan.

All the members of the expert panel, including the coordinator have signed agreements of freedom and confidentiality.

THE PROCESS OF EXTERNAL REVIEW

Application for state accreditation

TSRC applied for institutional accreditation by submitting the application form, the copies of the license and respective appendices to ANQA on 12.02.2021.

The ANQA Secretariat checked the data presented in the application form and attached documents. According to the decision on accepting the application an agreement was signed between ANQA and TSRC. The timetable of activities was prepared and approved.

Self-evaluation of the College was carried out by the working group developed according to the order of the Director of the College.

Self-evaluation

As TSRC was undergoing the process of institutional accreditation for the first time and the process was difficult for the College, ANQA carried out some activities with the College to prepare them for self-evaluation and accreditation processes.

In February, TSRC conducted a SWOT analysis for 2 weeks in accordance with 10 accreditation criteria. After the presentation of the SWOT analysis, the College nominated 2

employees, together with the employees of the ANQA they observed the SWOT analysis presented by the College for 1 month and identified the main problems. During that time, the ANQA coordinator instructed the College employees how to perform the SWOT analysis and what the college should pay attention to within the criteria during the self-analysis. After reviewing the SWOT analysis, the college staff as experts, together with the staff of the ANQA, conducted an online visit to the College on March 15, 2021.

The self-analysis of the institutional capacities of TSCR was presented on 06.08.2021. The self-analysis was carried out by 11 employees of the College: faculty and support staff, as well as the management. External stakeholders and internal stakeholders, students, did not participate in the self-evaluation process. Each criterion was analyzed by 1 employee, taking into account the employee's work orientation and criterion requirements.

The self-analysis report was mostly descriptive and general, which sometimes did not allow the experts to get an idea of the real situation in the College during the initial assessment.

Preparatory phase

After the self-evaluation report and accompanying documents were submitted by the TSRC, the ANQA Coordinator reviewed them for sat with the ANQA requirements.

The self-evaluation and all the attached documents were provided for preliminary assessment to the expert group, the composition of which was agreed with the College in advance and approved by the order of the ANQA Director.

In order to prepare the expert panel for work and ensure the efficiency of the processes, trainings were conducted on the following topics:

1. main functions of the members of the expert panel,
2. ethics and techniques of conducting meetings,
3. defining the peculiarities of the VET (Vocational Education and Training) sector and interpreting the accreditation criteria in accordance with the vocational education sector,
4. preliminary assessment as a stage of preparing an expert report, the main requirements for the report.

Having studied the College's self-evaluation and the package of accompanying documents, the expert panel carried out a preliminary evaluation according to the format, preparing a list of necessary documents to be further studied, as well as problems and questions, also indicating the relevant departments or target groups. Within the scheduled time, the expert panel summarized the results of the preliminary assessment, and the coordinator made the plan-schedule of the site-visit². Guided by the RA Vocational Education Examination Manual, the schedule included meetings planned by experts with all groups, open and closed meetings, document review, parallel meetings, etc.

During the site visits of the college, ANQA has added two parallel meetings as a novelty, during the parallel meetings the expert panel is divided, each expert according to his professional

² Appendix 2. Time-schedule of the site-visit

direction. Each expert (except for the student expert, he joined one of the other experts) had the opportunity to have two separate professional meetings with the professors teaching the APs presented by the College, the person in charge of the academic program, and the students. Before the professional meetings, the experts within their profession studied the assignments given to the students within the modules to understand how these assignments are aimed at achieving the performance standards defined in the module.

Preparatory visit

Considering the distance of TSRC from the capital, the preparatory visit to the College was made online two weeks before site-visit. ANQA coordinator, the Head of the Department of Institutional and Programmatic Expertise and the Head of the Expert Panel were present at the meeting. During the meeting, the time-schedule of the site-visit was presented to the college and agreed with them, as well decisions were made regarding the technical, organizational, informational issues of the site- visit, behavior and ethical norms of meeting participants.

Site visit

The site visit took place in 2021 between October 24-27. One day before the scheduled visit (23.11.2021), all members of the expert panel and the coordinator had a closed meeting. The purpose of the meeting was to bring out the strengths and weaknesses of the College according to the standards, clarify the questions to be asked to the target groups, discuss the procedure of the meetings and further steps.

The site-visit launched and ended with meetings with the Director of the College³.

The participants of the focus group meetings (faculty, students, graduates) organized in order to clarify the issues were selected from the list provided in advance, based on the principle of representativeness. All scheduled meetings were held, except for the open meeting. The expert panel also conducted class-observations. During the site-visit, the expert panel conducted document review, observation of resources and internship places as well as focus group meetings. At the closed meeting of the expert panel held at the end of each working day of the site- visit, the intermediate results of the expert evaluation were brought out, and at the end of the visit, the main results of the visit were summarized in a closed discussion.

The final conclusion on the criteria was reached by the expert panel as a result of discussions and analyzes of all members, always applying the principle of consensus.

Expert panel report

The members of the expert panel and the ANQA coordinator prepared a preliminary version of the expert panel report, which was agreed with the experts on December 2. A preliminary report was submitted to the College on 03 December 2021.

³ Appendix 3. List of he observed documents

On 24.12.2022, the College sent its response regarding the preliminary version of the expert panel report to ANQA. ANQA provided the observations made by the college to the expert panel. On 28.12.2022 ANQA organized an online meeting between the College and the expert panel to discuss the observations of the College. Taking into account the observations of the College, the expert panel made the final version of the expert panel report, which was approved by the panel on 29.12.2022.



Anahit Terteryan, Coordinator of the expert panel

29.12.2021

EVALUATION ACCORDING TO ACCREDITATION CRITERIA

BRIEF INFORMATION ABOUT THE EDUCATION INSTITUTION

History: Tavush State Regional College was founded in 1967 as a branch of Yerevan Light Industry Technical College. On the basis of the branch, the Soviet of Ministers of the Armenian Soviet Socialist Republic (ASSR) established Ijevan technical school by the decision as of July 25, 1968, which operated until 1972. In 1972 the technical school was renamed into Ijevan Industrial-Technological Technical School. According to the letter of the RA Ministry of Education and Science dated October 10, 1996, the educational institution was named after Academician Z. G. Ghazumyan. According to the decision on secondary vocational educational institutions of the RA Ministry of Education and Science as of December 3, 1999, the technical school was renamed into "Ijevan State College" SNCO. In 2001 by the decision of the Government of the Republic of Armenia and the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Armenia, the Ijevan Vocational Technical School No. 69 and the Ijevan Branch of the Yerevan Hydromelioration Base State College joined the College. In 2011 the SNCO was renamed into "Tavush State Regional College" SNCO.

Since its establishment, the institution has produced around 7,000 graduates. TSRC implements 8 primary vocational and secondary vocational academic programs, 2 of which are dual programs. Teaching in the College is carried out in a modular system. Currently, 304 students are studying at TSRC, of which 50 are in primary vocational, and 254 are in secondary vocational academic programs.

Education: TSRC implements the following primary vocational (craftsmanship) and secondary vocational academic programs: "Organization of Transportation and Transport Management", "Finance", "Tourism", "Technical Maintenance and Repair of Automobile Transport", "Pre-school Education", "Software of Computing Technology and Automated Systems", "Installation, Repair and Maintenance of Renewable Energy Power Plants", "Winemaking and Juice Production". The College generally has adequate teaching staff for teaching these professions.

Reforms at the TSRC launched in 2004, when TSRC became one of the four pilot colleges receiving support from the European Union's TESIS program. During that period, for the first time, the modular teaching experience was tested in the College.

Developing research/creative thinking. The internship fosters the implementation of research works to a certain extent, which contribute to the development of students' creative and analytical abilities.

External relations. The activation of relations with employers is one of the strategic issues of TSRC. The implementation of innovative, experimental programs in cooperation with various organizations

is also one of the goals of TSRC. The College has a number of agreements with local employer-organizations and international charity organizations, thanks to which it is able to provide a safe and favorable educational environment for students.

Quality assurance. The processes of quality assurance are in the stage of formation at TSRC. An attempt was made by the College to develop the "Quality Assurance Policy and Procedures" document, but it has not yet found its application, because the position of Internal Quality Assurance Officer has not yet been filled at TSRC.

Source: The sources for the information about the above mentioned spheres are the documents provided by the College (e.g. SER, strategic concept, etc.)

I. MISSION AND PURPOSES

CRITERION: The policies and procedures of the institution are in accordance with the institution's mission which is in line with ANQF.

Facts. The mission of the TSRC of the RA Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sports is described in 2018-2023. In the "Concept of the Development of Primary (Vocational) and Secondary Vocational Education" (hereinafter referred to as Concept of Development) and the Charter, according to which the main mission of the College is the creation, transfer and dissemination of knowledge, the formation of the national mindset of students, their own practices and decisions in the national interest, the preparation of capable citizens within the framework of the state strategy for the development of education.

The fundamental values adopted by the College are: accessibility, comprehensive development of the student, quality teaching staff, student participation and interpersonal relations. TSRC carries out its activities in accordance with the 3rd, 4th and 5th levels of the National Qualifications Framework (NQF): primary vocational and secondary vocational education (the 3rd level refers to the general education block). The APs of the College are in line with the NQF.

In order to achieve the goals stipulated in its Concept of Development, the college presents 11 strategic objectives, some of which are related to active steps, for example, in the direction of implementing the leading experience of the dual education system of European countries, it implements 2 dual pilot APs: "Tourism" and " Technical Maintenance and Repair of Automobile Transport" professions. 1 primary vocational education program "Winemaking and Juice Production" is also implemented in a dual format and logic.

It became clear from the site-visit that the College plans to further develop "Installation, Repair and Maintenance of Renewable Energy Power Plants", "Winemaking and Juice Production" professions and aims to obtain license for the agricultural profession of "Technology of Oil, Cheese and Milk Production". Meetings with stakeholders showed that systematic analyzes of the labor market are not carried out, it takes place within the framework of College-employer dialogue.

It should also be stated that there are objectives defined in the Concept of Development, which are not measurable and do not imply specific actions, for example, "ensure the development of the nation, the formation of a modern individual and citizen bringing to a new level, the reproduction and development of the intellectual potential and workforce of the society, social cohesion, which will bring stability and democracy" and so on.

There are also defined objectives in the Concept of the College, for the implementation of which continuous active, effective steps are not taken, for example, provision of various services to the community, provision of methodical support to individual groups of society or regional institutions. From the site-visit to the College, the expert panel learnt that with the support of "Ferti" charity center and the Community Hall as well as with the efforts of college students, water heaters were installed on the roofs of 3 kindergartens and 1 preschool. Students of the profession of

"Installation, Repair and Maintenance of Renewable Energy Power Plants" also participated in these works and they received some remuneration. This is a uniquely successful experience.

The Concept of Development does not have a time-schedule, the sequence of concrete actions is not defined, responsible people and KPIs are not defined that will bring to the implementation of the mentioned objectives.

According to the SER, the external stakeholder for the College is considered the RA Government, The RA Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sports, employers, regional authority, alumni and parents, and the internal stakeholders are students, faculty and staff.

The Concept of Development was approved by the Governing Board of the College. During the site-visit it became clear that the Concept was developed by one person, internal and external stakeholders were not immediately involved in the development process. During the visit it also became clear that while developing the Concept of Development the SP of Tavush Region and the results of TSCR-employer dialogue were taken into account. In the cases of some APs the needs of the employers are revealed within the framework of the academic programs organized in the dual format: "Tourism", "Technical Maintenance and Repair of Automobile Transport" as well as "winery and Juice Production". There are also APs ("Preschool Education" and "Finances") that ensure smooth transition to university as in these professions the graduates cannot find work and the employers prefer the ones who have higher education.

There is no mid-term planning in TSRC and the basis for the short-term planning are the annual plans of structural units and that of the presidents of cyclic committees however they are not derived from the Concept but rather are the results of everyday work.

There is no policy on the revision and monitoring of the Concept of Development at TSRC, it is not periodically reviewed and improved.

The evaluation of strategic goals is based on the annual reports of the departments, which are mainly descriptive, indicators of the implementation of the goals are not defined in the Concept of development, which will allow to evaluate the effectiveness of the processes implemented in the College.

Considerations.

The expert panel considers it positive that TSCR has a strategy and goals indicating the scope of activity defined by law for a secondary vocational educational institution, the activities carried out by the College generally correspond to the mission, but there are defined general goals that do not generally express the peculiarities of the College (for example: knowledge creation).

The expert panel considers it positive that the College envisions its future development directions through the introduction of educational programs: "Installation, Repair and Maintenance of Renewable Energy Power Plants", "Winemaking and Juice Production", but the effectiveness of the introduction of new professions may be jeopardized, because TSRC did not carry out a clear and systematic analysis of the labor market and did not calculate all possible risks and dangers.

It is encouraging that TSCRC sets before itself the strategic objective of providing services in accordance with the needs of the community, and has a positive experience in this direction, which emphasizes the assumption of societal responsibility of the College. The acquisition and continuous implementation of such programs can contribute to the strengthening of community-college ties, the acquisition of additional income, and at the same time the formation of practical skills among students.

Despite the fact that internal and external stakeholders did not directly participate in the process of developing the Concept of Development, the development directions of the region, as well as the needs of employers to a certain extent were the basis for formulating the goals and objectives, as a result of which the defined goals and objectives are mostly realistic and needs of internal and external stakeholders.

The expert panel is positive about the fact that there is a long-term planning at the College for 5 years however the mid-term and short-term planning derived from the Concept of Development for the control over the actions is missing, there are no qualitative and quantitative indicators of assessment either that would allow to evaluate the full implementation of the Concept of Development.

The existence of mechanisms for review and improvement of the Concept of Development will allow regular clarification of the defined goals and objectives, making the Concept a flexible and operational document.

Summary: Taking into account that the activities of TSRC are mainly in line with the sphere of vocational education, the RA NQF, mission, goals and objectives partly express the needs of internal and external stakeholders, the expert panel finds that TSRC meets the requirements of Criterion 1.

Conclusion: *The correspondence of the institutional capacities of TSRC to the requirements of Criterion 1 is satisfactory.*

II. GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

CRITERION: The institution's system of governance, administrative structures and their activities are efficient and are aimed at the accomplishment of mission and goals of the institution preserving ethical norms of governance.

Facts: TSRC is a state non-governmental organization and has its management bodies according to the legislation: Governing Board (GB) and Director. The formation and functions of the GB are defined in the Charter of the College. The GB includes employers, representatives of the Joint Social Service, the founder and the authorized body, professors and students, and a representative of the trade union.

There are also administrative, pedagogical and educational- methodical professional councils at TSRC, whose powers and activities are regulated by the order of powers and activities of the

administrative, pedagogical and educational-methodical professional councils of "Tavush State Regional College" SNCO.

Concept of Development of the College clearly defines the structure of the which reflects the relationships and connections between the structural units of the College. In the work plans of the units of the TSRC, the interdependence and cooperation of the units are not fully visible, but the cooperation exists in a non-documented format.

The Director of the College has two deputies: Deputy Director on Educational Affairs and Deputy Director on Organizational Affairs who coordinate and control the activities taking place in the College. The College has a Career center (1 employee), the Department of Internship (2 employees, Head of the Department and an instructor of dual), internal QA unit (is not staffed yet). During the site-visit it became clear that the College envisages to employ a QA staff member in January 2023. The works of the structural units are being carried out according to the job descriptions or regulations. It should also be noted that the functions are not defined based on the goals and objectives of the Concept of Development. The college has 4 cyclic Committees: Auto Operation, Economic, Natural Sciences, Humanities.

The University has a long-term planning in the form of the Concept of Development where the goals of the College are defined but the qualitative and quantitative indicators for the evaluation of the effectiveness of the implementation of goals is missing,

The Deputy Directors, Presidents of the Cyclic Committees and the Head of the Career Center have work plans. As a result of the observation of the documents and meeting with the stakeholders, it became clear that the planning of the structural units is carried out in a traditional way according to the annual works. This is also evidenced by the fact that the plans are repeated for each year and are not always based on the strategic goals of the college, and the reports are presented according to the existing plans.

The lecturers are involved in management circles: GB, Pedagogical Council, Administrative Council, Educational- Methodical Council. Students are involved in the Student Council (SC) and GB. According to the work procedure of the GB of the College, two lecturers from the teaching staff are nominated as members of the GB by the decision of the Pedagogical Council, and three students from the student body are nominated by the Students' Council. From the study of the documents, it became clear that the College has the protocols of the Pedagogical Council and the Students' Council for the inclusion of lecturers and students in the GB, but the meetings with the stakeholders showed that the latter are not well informed about the procedure of their nomination⁴. It should also be noted that representatives of students and faculty do not raise issues in the GB, and they do not have mechanisms for raising the needs of the faculty and students.

There are no monitoring and needs assessment procedures in the College for raising needs, it is done only verbally.

It should also be noted that decision-making at different levels of management is not always based on the analysis of reliable data, for example, there are licensed APs that did not take into

⁴ The sentence was reformulated based on the comments of the College.

account the requirements of the labor market when they were implemented, for example, the "Jurisprudence" AP, for several years there is no admission for this profession.

The meetings with the stakeholders proved that not all decisions of the GB are accessible to the internal stakeholders, the information dissemination mechanisms are imperfect.

TSRC receives the necessary funding for its activities from the state budget according to the number of students. Most of the college's budget goes to salaries. During the site- visit, it became clear that the college sometimes also implements short-term programs, due to which it becomes possible to make certain savings. Since the current year the College has the opportunity to make some savings due to the installation of solar panels, but no plans have been made to use the savings because it is unclear how much funding will be given to the College next year.

All mandatory positions on the staff list are filled. The College needs a number of specialists, which are not provided to the College according to the staff list, but they are urgent for carrying out effective activities, for example, masters and specialists for the implementation of short-term programs, as a result of which the material and technical base of the College is not fully used.

The processes carried out in TSRC are mainly in the planning and implementation stage, the monitoring and evaluation mechanisms are almost absent in the College which leads to the fact that the improvements take place on the basis of situational and not precise analyses. This is also evidenced by the fact that the College is late in responding to the challenges it faces.

TSRC collects certain quantitative data about its APs, such as data collected by the Career Center on graduate employment. This information is transferred to the RA Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sports, but such data are not published.

TSRC uses the College's Facebook page as a platform to provide information about its activities, but quantitative and qualitative information about the quality of APs and awarded qualifications is scarce.

Considerations.

The expert panel considers it positive that the College has a clearly defined structure, but it is a concern that the cooperation of the structural units is weakly expressed and the defined functions are not based on the goals and objectives of the Concept of Development, as a result of which the full implementation of the goals of Concept of Development may be jeopardized.

The expert panel considers it positive that the structure of the College defined in the Concept of Development, the structural units and infrastructures mentioned are equipped with the appropriate positions, but it is concerning that the position of a staff member for IQA is not filled, which has led to the fact that the quality assurance, data collection and analysis processes do not take place completely and systematically.

The College has a strategic plan, where the goals and objectives are mentioned however the latter has not turned to a long term strategic plan yet. The planning of structural units and infrastructures is based only on previous experience and current work, and lacks a clear analysis of the previous period, so they do not guarantee the implementation of the strategic plan.

The fact that decisions are not always accessible to internal and external stakeholders indicates that the vertical communication of management is not effective, because the units in a hierarchical relationship do not fully cooperate. For example, the data provided by the Career Center show information that graduates are not able to realize with their professions for various reasons, including the problem of foreign language skills, but no decision has been made in the College to solve this problem.

The expert panel considers the regulated election in the councils of the College as positive, but the lack of responsibility and initiativeness of the members of the GB may hinder the needs assessment and discussion of the problems and proposals of the internal stakeholders in the GB⁵.

The expert panel considers it positive that the College is trying to create additional sources of income, but as a result of incomplete management, that is, non-targeted steps towards the involvement of specialists, the College management finds it difficult to implement short- and mid-term clear and systematic planning processes, so the college's laboratories and the remaining resources are not fully utilized.

Summary. Taking into account that TSRC management system, administrative structures and their activities are not coordinated, the administration of policies and procedures is not carried out according to the principle of quality management (plan, do, check, act), the College does not have systematic mechanisms and policies for collecting reliable data, accordingly, decision-making does not take place on reliable, analyzed data, there is no mid-term and short-term planning according to the Concept of Development, the expert panel finds that TSRC does not meet the requirements of CRITERIA 2.

Conclusion: *The correspondence of the institutional capacities of TSRC to the requirements of Criterion 2 is unsatisfactory.*

III. ACADEMIC PROGRAMS

CRITERION: The programmes are in concord with the Institution's mission, form part of institutional planning and promote mobility and internationalization.

Facts: TSRC provides education with primary vocational (craftsman) and secondary vocational academic programs. The college has 3 craftsman-based professions: "Cooking" (based on basic education), "Installation, Repair and Maintenance of Renewable Energy Power Plants" (based on basic education), "Winemaking and Juice Production" (based on basic education) and secondary vocational 6 professions: "Organization of Transportation and Transport Management". (on the basis of basic education), "Preschool education" (on the basis of primary and secondary education), "Tourism" (on the basis of primary and secondary education), "Software for computing equipment and automated systems" (on the basis of primary and secondary education), "Finance" (on the basis of primary and secondary education) and "Motor vehicle maintenance and repair" (on the basis of

⁵ The sentence was reformulated based on the comments of the College.

primary and secondary education) professions. APs correspond to State Educational Standards. 304 students study in primary and secondary vocational education programs.

There are two dual APs in the College: “Tourism” and “Technical Maintenance and Repair of Automobile Transport”. During the site-visit it became clear that dual APs and curriculums have been redeveloped by the College with the active involvement of employers. The College has a permission for the conduction of part-time (correspondence) study in “Jurisprudence” (with the basis of secondary education) however during the recent years no admission was carried out.

There is a difference of opinion among the internal stakeholders of TSRC regarding the “Organization of Transportation and Transport Management” AP: some of the stakeholders believe that it is no longer vital, because the graduates of this profession mainly find jobs in the traffic police staff and guard services not in their specialty, and according to the Government's decision, the traffic police will be replaced by the patrol service, which will lead to the shortage of workplaces. And some argue that it is relevant because students don't go to high school, they come to college to have both a profession and an opportunity to go to the University. Graduates of "Finance" and "Preschool Education" professions cannot find their place in the labor market, because employers and the state give preference to graduates with higher education for these fields. This is also confirmed by the data of the Career Center, according to which no student works in this profession, graduates only have the opportunity to be easily admitted to the 2nd year of the part-time department of the same profession at any university in case of good and excellent performance. From the meeting with students it became clear that internship in the direction of “Finance” profession mainly are not organized as the regulation of the bank system does not allow, or the internship lasts only 1 day in the passive observation mode.

In order to ensure the success of dual education programs, cooperation with employers has been intensified, and the needs of the employer have been taken into account when developing the APs. In particular, the package of modular programs of the "Tourism" specialty did not include the "Organization of Hiking" module, which was developed upon the suggestion of the employer. There was also a change in the distribution of theoretical and practical hours. more hours were allocated to practical training. As it became clear during the site-visit, out of the 2 special professional modules of the "Tourism" specialty, the "International Regulation of Tourism Services" and "Applied Economics" modules in the dual format are not effective, because the employer does not have the appropriate specialists to teach them. The Cyclic Committee is considering revising these modules and removing them from the dual program.

As a result of the class observations, it became clear that the lecturers use some interactive methods during teaching: dialogue, group teaching, teaching with slides, which are mainly aimed at achieving relevant outcomes. The College does not have a clearly developed policy for choosing teaching and learning methods. The content of generic modules does not always reflect the professional orientation, for example the content of the “Communication Skills” module is presented generically and does not relate to the profession in which it is taught.

From the class observation, study of documents and assignments, it became clear that within the framework of some modules, “Organization of Transportation and Transport Management”, "Engineering Graphics", "Computer Operations", "Permits and Settlements, Measuring Instruments and Measurement Techniques", the assignments given to students mainly provide the performance criteria for the module. There are also modules, for example, "Fundamentals of Materials Science", within the framework of which test tasks have been developed, which are generally not enough to recognize the profiles of metal preparations, to acquire the ability to use the principles of marking in practice.

The practical assignments given within the framework of the module “Types and Classification of Hotels and Tourist Complexes” of “Tourism” profession mainly cover the LOs defined in the module and their implementation criteria.

As a result of the class observations it became clear that in a number of cases the practical lessons are a reproduction of the theoretical material, and the test tasks given at the end of the module do not test skills and competences, but only knowledge. For some lecturers dictation is still the primary teaching method. Students are sometimes given practical assignments, for which the students still do not have the appropriate theoretical knowledge base, and they perform the assignment not due to the already acquired knowledge and abilities, but based on the sample provided by the lecturer, for example, to make a route, students do not have mapping, skills for correct calculation of costs, but complete the assignment with a similar example given by the lecturer.

During the class observation it also became clear that in those professions where a foreign language is professional, in some cases the teaching methodology is not chosen correctly, for example, English and French are taught in Armenian. This results in the fact that students have a problem with foreign language skills, which is also confirmed by employers. During the site-visit, it also became clear that students have to look for alternative ways of learning a foreign language, and employers noted that students of "Tourism" profession also lack in the knowledge of service sector and communication skills with customers.

It became clear from the meetings with the stakeholders that the theoretical knowledge given by the lecturer is not always comparable to the employer's requirements and applicable in the practical field, for example, the employer claims that the tour packages developed during the practical training at the College within the module “Development of Tour Packages” in "Tourism" profession are partially applicable in practice, and students create new ones during practical training at the employer under the direct supervision of a practitioner.

From the site-visit and the study of documents, it became clear that the reports of educational and pre-graduate internships do not contain analytical elements, students generally do not receive assignments from lecturers and employers containing analyzes, students and employers do not have joint research works.

The evaluation in TSRC is carried out on a 10-point scale. During dual educational programs and internships, the student's abilities are also evaluated by the employer, and the final evaluation is formed as a result of the theory and practice.

Diaries have been developed for dual APs, in which 3 levels are presented: knowledge, skills and competences. Skills and competences are evaluated with a 10-point scale, and knowledge with "has" or "has not". A dual diary is created for each student, becoming a separate portfolio, as it records the student's work experience and clearly shows professional competencies. Assessments in the diary are carried out by professionals from the College and the employer. The dual diary format is used for both "Tourism" and "Technical Maintenance and Repair of Automobile Transport" professions. From the examination of the documents, it became clear that unlike the diaries of the "Tourism" profession, the components of knowledge, skills and competences were filled in by the employers, signed and approved in the diaries of the "Technical Maintenance and Repair of Automobile Transport" profession.

The final attestation for all the professions at the College is carried out with an exam, the final exam questionnaire are developed from special and general professional modules which assumes the repetition of already covered materials of the modules. During the site-visit it became clear that previously the defense of final papers was organized which is now not applied as the students with lower academic progress were not able to pass it. During the site-visit the teaching staff also stated that the previous method was more effective. During the observation of resources when studying the previous final papers in the archive documents it became clear that those works were more effective as they developed student's research, analytical and systematic thinking.

From the study of the documents, it was found that at the 3rd session of the Educational Methodological Council in 2021, a decision was made to conduct the final attestation of the profession "Winemaking and Juice Production" with a diploma project, but the track of the decision is not visible, because there was no admission in that specialty this year.

In all the modular programs of the studied professions, the program details are missing, the assessment measures are not specified, the resources required by the employer are missing in the dual modular programs. According to the 18th point of the regulation of the Governing Board of TSRC, the Board discusses the curricula and drafts of modular/subject programs. A review of the documents revealed that they were not approved by the Board.

In terms of content, the APs of TSRC are consistent with the similar APs of the Armenian professional educational institutions, because they all are based on the same State Educational Standards. Student mobility is not registered at any level, but if necessary, it is possible at the Armenian level, because the programs are completely comparable. During the site-visit, it became clear that during the implementation of the dual educational program, it became necessary to study other similar educational programs, the College studied the curricula of Yerevan Armenian-Greek State College of Tourism and Yerevan State College of Humanities, modular programs, as a result of which program benchmarking was carried out in an informal way. As a result of benchmarking, it

was decided in what proportion to divide the hours and what changes to make in the curriculum. Mobility among the lecturers is also lacking.

APs are mainly monitored by Cyclic Committees and are limited to changes in the distribution of theoretical and practical hours. In recent years, the APs have mostly not been revised, in terms of content, revisions are taking place in educational programs implemented in dual mode. For wider monitoring and improvement, the College is waiting for the revisions of National Centre for Vocational Education and Training Development.

Considerations: The expert panel considers it positive that the College has both previously implemented and newly introduced modern specialties, such as "Installation, Repair and Maintenance of Renewable Energy Power Plants", "Winemaking and Juice Production", "Software of Computing Equipment and Automated Systems", "Tourism". In addition, it is noteworthy that as a result of the introduction of modern educational approaches, the college-employer connection has been activated, as a result of which dual APs of two professions have been developed.

The fact that TSRC has licensed professions, for example, "Software of Computer Equipment and Automated Systems", "Tourism" and "Motor Vehicle Maintenance and Repair" professions based on secondary education, for which no admissions were made in 2020, in the same year, on the basis of secondary education "Finance" and "Preschool Education" majors had one applicant each, and on the basis of primary education, there were no applicants in "Culinary" profession in the primary vocational education programs. Therefore, the effectiveness of the selection and implementation of professions is not clear. The College also did not analyze the reasons.

The effectiveness of "Organization of Transportation and Transport Management", "Finance" and "Preschool Education" professions is not substantiated, and one of the reasons is that the occupation profile of "Organization of Transportation and Transport Management" profession is somewhat different from the college image, graduates of "Finance" and "Preschool Education" cannot work with a secondary professional qualification, but the fact of being the only one in the region places an obligation on the College to ensure continuous education. Educational internships of the "Finance" profession may be in danger, as the banks operating in the city do not always cooperate. There is no unified analysis of the labor market requirements and future career opportunities of graduates from the perspective of the APs implemented in the College.

The expert panel is positive about the fact that during the development of dual APs some requirements of employers were taken into account, new APs were developed, practical hours were increased, however in teaching some modules the resources of employers are limited, such as during the modules on "International Regulation of Tourism Services" and "Applied Economics" the lecturer gives theoretical knowledge however an employer cannot ensure practical skill which can endanger the effectiveness of the performance of the course in terms of acquisition of necessary skills and competences.

It is positive that the College is giving importance to the application of some interactive methods in education process, however there is no policy for their selection and localization, the best practice is not disseminated, sometimes the link between the theory and practice is interrupted

within the module, sometimes theoretical knowledge is not applicable in practice, thus in some cases the employer has to fill in the gaps of knowledge instead of developing the skills and competences.

The assignments studied by the expert panel mainly correspond to the requirements defined in the criteria of the acquiring the module outcome and foster the formation of independent and analytical thinking of the student.

The expert panel finds it positive that due to the introduction of dual educational program unified approaches to the assessment of skills and competences have been developed as a result of which individual diaries/ individual packages/portfolios of students were formed. In case of finalization and right application of the latter the employer will no longer demand a work experience however it is troublesome that they are not always fully filled in.

It is worrying that the means of assessing module outcomes are not specified, sometimes they do not correspond to the approaches to assessing the skills and competences required by the LO, which jeopardizes the effectiveness of the TSRC assessment system, i.e. mainly knowledge is tested.

It is worrisome that during the final attestation, students' acquired skills are generally not checked, because the latter take a state final exam from oral, special and general professional modules, so to check the skills and competences, it is necessary to introduce such a form of final assessment that will allow not to deviate from the LO and at the same time maintain academic integrity.

The expert panel considers it positive that some APs have been combined with similar programs, steps have been taken in the direction of benchmarking, even though in a verbal version, which will contribute to the mobility of students in the future.

It is encouraging that the Cyclic Committees carry out ongoing revisions in the APs, but the main monitoring and reforms concern only the APs of professions implemented with a dual education program or implemented in a similar format, and the rest of the professions have not been monitored so deeply. As a result, the monitoring mechanisms in TSRC are not systematic and institutionally functional for all professions.

Summary: Taking into account that the APs of TSRC are in line with the State Educational Standards, they are described in detail according to the qualifications awarded and the expected learning outcomes, the newly introduced APs were developed in collaboration with employers, the use of interactive methods in the educational process is emphasized, there are benchmarking and certain mechanisms for monitoring the APs, the expert panel finds that TSRC meets the requirements of Criterion 3.

Conclusion: *The correspondence of the institutional capacities of TSRC to the requirements of Criterion 3 is satisfactory.*

IV. STUDENTS

CRITERION: The Institution provides support services to students ensuring productive learning environment.

Facts: TSRC has an admission procedure that is approved by the state, at the beginning of the year the College submits an application to the Ministry for paid and free places, licenses according to specialties. Admission to the College is carried out in a competitive manner based on the grades of the certificate of basic education, certificate of secondary education, primary or secondary vocational, diploma of higher education. For 2 years now, because of the epidemic, admission to the College has been organized online through the emis.am website.

From the site- visit, it became clear that before each year's admission, a selected team from the College visits the schools for professional orientation, presenting the professions and career opportunities of the College. The group meets with graduates of 9th and 12th grades of high and basic schools, answers their questions. Sometimes the graduates of the schools themselves also visit the college to learn about the opportunities offered by the College. There are also leaflets presenting the list of professions.

There is a facebook page of TSRC where announcements are put about the professions existing at the College, about the paid and free of charge places for each profession provided by the Ministry, the regulation on admission, documents necessary for admission.

The first important link in the identification of students' needs in TSRC is the students' group instructor, and as it became clear from the site-visit, the work of the students' group instructor is an effective and acceptable mechanism for students, taking into account their age characteristics. TSRC has an intenship instructor (for dual program) who addresses the educational needs of students concerning internship, for example, choosing the place of internship, solving the problems that arose during the internship, etc.

From the site-visit, it was found that the Career Center conducted a pilot survey once, which aimed to reveal the degree of satisfaction of students with the lecturer and the course conducted by that lecturer, but the results of the surveys were not generalized and analyzed, nor were they communicated to the stakeholders.

Additional consultations for students are organized upon request. Basically, the students receive counsultation on the eve of re-submitting the module result and the final attestation exams, they are organized by the students' group instructors. In addition, the College has a psychologist who talks and provides counsultancy to the students returning from the war, but a visit to the units made it clear that the psychologist has not worked in his profession for a long time and does not know modern special psychological methods. The College has not conducted an analysis of the effectiveness of counsultancy provided to students.

From the site-visit it became clear that there is no regulation and schedule for contacting the administrative staff at TSRC, the stakeholders stated that students can approach the administrative

staff at any time, but such cases have not been recorded yet, because in the case of problems, they get their solution at the level of students' group instructors.

The College has a Career Center, which provides its services in the form of informal courses through which students master the requirements of creating a competitive resume, searching for employers, introducing themselves to employers, searching for information on job sites, etc. As it became clear from the site-visit, as a result of the cooperation of the Career Center and the internship instructor (dual), meetings with the employer and successful graduates were organized, but they were not frequent. Contact with alumni is primarily maintained by students' group instructors and the Careers Adviser. The latter regularly submits a report to the Ministry on the employment of their graduates, creates information base on graduates and employers.

It became clear from the site-visit that the students in the College are not mainly engaged in research work, but there are some positive attempts in this regard. For example, students of "Tourism" make tour packages at the employer, researching pricing policy, resource efficiency, PR tools, etc. Students of the "Software of Computer Engineering and Automated Systems" profession are engaged in robotics in the "Armat" engineering laboratory of the College, but such cases are unique.

In TSRC the SC was reformed in June 2021. The activity of the SC is regulated and somewhat planned, but the SC charter does not specify how the SC members are elected. It became clear from the site-visit that they are nominated by the students' group instructors. During the meeting, it was also revealed that members of the SC and students are not informed about their rights and responsibilities. The scope of the latter's activities is limited to the organization of events and the control of the sanitary and hygienic situation in the College.

The mechanisms for raising the needs of students by the SC are imperfect, this is also evidenced by the fact that students' problems are not raised in management circles.

Considerations. The expert panel considers it positive that the College is taking active steps to recruit students. The existence of a Facebook page is also highlighted, where information about admission is posted, which contributes to the continuous enrollment of applicants. At the same time, evaluating the effectiveness of the measures will help to highlight the problems and then increase the number of applicants.

The expert panel considers the participation of students' group instructors in the process of raising students' needs to be effective, because during frequent meetings with them, students' problems are raised and solutions are given to them. A pilot survey conducted by the Career Center Officer to identify needs is also encouraged, but there is a need to analyze the data and further improve the questionnaire. It is also encouraging that the Career Center makes efforts to support students in entering the labor market. It is a positive experience that meetings with employers and successful graduates are organized with the internship (dual) instructor, which can contribute to increasing motivation and professional orientation of students. For the expert panel the continuation of such activities is encouraged.

The expert panel notes that engaging in research work will contribute to the development of students' analytical and creative thinking as well as the acquisition of practical skills, especially since

the College has a suitable environment for conducting research work due to the presence of various laboratories.

The expert panel emphasizes that the members of the SC are aware of their basic rights and responsibilities, because the lack of this fact can jeopardize the raising of the educational needs of the students and the autonomy.

The expert panel emphasizes that students are given a variety of consultancy, but it is necessary to carry out analyzes of their effectiveness to understand their purpose and usefulness.

Summary. Taking into account that the College has recruitment mechanisms for applicants, there is a facebook page for the dissemination of information about the admission, there are certain mechanisms for revealing students' needs, some services promoting career development are implemented, there is a structure presenting the students' rights, the expert panel finds that TSRC meets the requirements of Criterion 4.

Conclusion: *The correspondence of the institutional capacities of TSRC to the requirements of Criterion 4 is satisfactory.*

V. FACULTY AND STAFF

CRITERION: The Institution ensures the implementation of research activity and the link of the research with teaching and learning.

Facts: In 2018, the "Procedure for organizing and conducting a competition for the vacant position of a lecturer or an industrial training master" was developed for the selection of faculty and support staff at the TSRC, and in 2020, the "Policy and Procedure for Admission and Dismissal of Faculty and Support Staff" was developed. According to the "Procedure for organizing and conducting a competition for the vacant position of a lecturer or an industrial training master" a competition is held for the selection of a lecturer, which is held by a pre-formed committee, a questionnaire is developed, which includes questions relevant to the modules to be taught by the lecturer. In order to participate in the competition, the lecturer has requirements that correspond to the requirements of the State Educational Standards, that is, the lecturer conducting training sessions must have a qualification of secondary or higher professional education corresponding to the nature of the course to be taught or work experience in the field of the given profession, if in the direction of the given course secondary or higher education is not carried out in the Republic of Armenia, the presence of professional work experience is desirable for lecturers conducting special professional courses.

According to the document "Policy and Procedure for Admission and Dismissal of Faculty and Support Staff", the process of need for staff and recruitment at TSRC involves several stages: determining the demand for personnel, searching for potential candidates, assessing the suitability of the applicant. The suitability of the applicant for the position is evaluated through several criteria: level of education, qualification, work experience. These criteria are determined for each position

based on the qualification requirements for the positions of specialists and other employees. Depending on the position held by the applicant, a competition is held.

During the site-visit it became clear that in 2019-2021 two competitions were held during which 4 lecturers were elected and employed.

The support staff is selected in a non-competitive manner. here the experience and qualifications of the latter are taken into account.

From the study of the documents, it became clear that there are specialists who teach such modules and subjects that differ from their qualifications and the main taught modules, in particular, a specialist with the qualification "Milk, Dairy Product Technologist" teaches "Event Organization and Service in Hotels", a specialist with the profession of "Decorative Applied Arts", a qualified artist teaches "Safety and First Aid" module and other cases. The reason for such cases, as was presented during the site-visit, is the scarcity of specialists in the region and the many years of work experience of these specialists in that field.

The requirements for the professional qualities of the teaching staff of TSRC are reflected in the State Educational Standards corresponding to the given APs, in the "Procedure for the organization and conduct of the competition for the vacancy of a lecturer or master of industrial training" and in the document "Lecturer's workplace passport", but the special requirements of APs, such as clear practical skills, knowledge of a foreign language, knowledge of specific programs and other abilities are not required from the lecturer to carry out activities within the given profession.

Job descriptions are available for the positions of administrative and support staffs, guard, furnace keeper, cleaner, accountant, head of personnel department, electrician, nurse, as well as presidents of Cyclic Committees.

For the regular evaluation of teaching staff, the College has developed a "Regulation on Rewarding, Encouraging (including financial interest) or Disciplinary action and Dismissal of the Director of the College and Staff", but the regulation lacks a toolkit for the evaluation of lecturers. In the self-analysis, it is mentioned that one of the mechanisms for the evaluation of lecturers is class observation, which are carried out according to the schedule. From the study of the documents, it became clear that there are specially developed class observation templates, the class observations are recorded and summarized by Cyclic Committees, there are minutes of the summary session, but these minutes lack the data required in the template, that is, pedagogical mastery, used teaching methods, the link of the theory to practice, availability, etc. The study of the class observation papers showed that the class observations did not reveal any specific problems. During the site-visit, it became clear that the issues raised as a result of the class observation are not recorded, but they are discussed and resolved verbally in the Cyclic Committees.

From the study of documents and the site-visit it became clear that the Career Center had made an attempt to evaluate the teaching staff through the surveys conducted among the students. However, as it became clear, the survey results were not generalized, the data analysis and evaluation are missing. The survey results are not presented to the interested parties: Cyclic Committees and Education Department. There is no clear goal and frequency for the conduction of surveys.

There is no procedure for raising the needs of teachers in TSRC, but the site-visit made it clear that in order to raise the needs of the lecturers, discussions are held in Cyclic Committees, the Pedagogical Council and Educational-Methodical Council, but they are not systematic, there is no clear format, periodicity, examples of solved problems. The College has an established schedule of peer-class observation, according to which lecturers conduct class observation at their colleagues, and mainly these are of the nature of exchange of experience, or senior lecturers conduct class observation to help beginners on a mentoring basis.

Some members of the teaching staff were trained on the topics of "Organic Agriculture", "Introduction of Dual System Elements in VET Institutions", "Art of Staying Healthy", "Life Skills and Employability", "Teaching Entrepreneurship Module", "Increasing the Efficiency of Organization and Implementation of Ability-oriented Learning Process" and "EU for Youth: Skills for the Future". The teaching staff also participates in the trainings organized by the National Centre for Vocational Education and Training Development. The latter is partly planned, it is carried out every year. The trainings organized by the National Centre for Vocational Education and Training Development are methodological in nature. From the site-visit, it became clear that most of the trainings did not arise from the needs of the lecturers, only the trainings implemented by the National Centre for Vocational Education and Training Development included the newly admitted or those who were trained five years ago. During the meeting with the lecturers, it was also revealed that during the pandemic, many of them participated in online distance courses and acquired the skills of mastering IT tools to organize distance courses. It should also be noted that the effectiveness of the trainings was not evaluated.

During the site-visit and the meeting with the teaching staff, it became clear that most of them need professional training. Only the accountant took part in paid professional training on the topic "AS-Accountant 6 (public sector)".

It became clear from the site-visit that the young professors graduated from the university and immediately went to work in the College and do not have the skills to work in the practical field, which creates a certain problem for the implementation of practical lessons. This problem is partially solved within the framework of dual APs, when 50 percent of the lesson hours defined in the curriculum are carried out at employer, and the employer's specialists work with the students.

It also became clear from the meeting with the stakeholders that the specialists conducting practical training at the employer do not receive methodological support from the College regarding the use of teaching tools. Employers are only given practical training programs by topic.

The College has developed a "Policy of Mentoring of Novice Lecturers", the goals of which are to provide general frameworks of mentoring based on the principle of emulating best practices, to assist young professionals in the formation and acquisition of professional and pedagogical abilities and skills, to develop the analytical skills of a novice lecturer, the ability to develop and present recommendations for education reforms. From the site-visit and meetings with stakeholders, it became clear that these functions are carried out in Cyclical Committees, where, according to the

profession, young personnel are attached to more experienced teachers, the latter share their experience with them. Their efficiency is evaluated to a certain extent during the meetings of the Cyclic Committee and the sessions of Methodical Council.

There are 43 lecturers working at TSRC, 6 of them are double-jobbers, one of them is an employer. The teaching staff has higher education. All pedagogical positions are filled, there is only a need for specialists teaching "Winemaking and Juice Production" and "Installation, Repair and Maintenance of Renewable Energy Power Plants". The retirement age of the specialist teaching the first specialty has expired, and the College cannot find a teacher in the second specialty.

The number of employer- lecturers is limited, they have 1 employed lecturer. From the meeting with the employers it became clear that only one employer was offered to teach by the college administration. The employers mentioned that in the case of the offer, their employment does not allow them to teach.

TSRC gives importance to the involvement of young personnel. Every year there is an increase of young personnel. The College considers this to be one of its strengths.

In the education management system of RA, there is no policy of professional advancement of teaching staff for secondary professional educational institutions, no other mechanisms of category or position advancement have been implemented in the College. In order to encourage lecturers, TSRC has developed a "Regulation on Rewarding, Encouraging (including financial interest) or Disciplinary action and Dismissal of the Director of the College and Staff". From the site-visit and meetings with the stakeholders, it became clear that the incentives are mainly verbal, the candidacy of one of the lecturers as a distinguished teacher was presented to the Ministry for the Teacher's Day in 2021 and he/she was awarded with an honorary certificate. In December 2020, the College provided a financial incentive to all lecturers at the same rate from its savings.

The recruitment of positions at the College depends on the number of students, according to which all positions are filled with the 2021 job list. Only to coordinate the QA processes, TSRC does not have a QA responsible person.

Considerations: The expert panel considers it positive that the College selects the teaching staff necessary to implement its APs in a competitive manner, which can ensure the involvement of qualified personnel. This is confirmed by the minutes of the competition committee, in which applicants who did not meet certain requirements were not allowed to participate in the competition, or in the case of more than one applicant, priority was given to an experienced specialist.

At the same time, the expert group considers it a concern that there are professors who teach professional modules that do not correspond to their qualifications, which may jeopardize the effectiveness of the course.

At the same time, the expert panel considers is concerned that there are lecturers who teach professional modules that do not correspond to their qualifications, which may jeopardize the effectiveness of the course.

In spite of the fact that TSRC has not established specific requirements for the professional qualities of the teaching staff for each AP, the College is guided by the requirements of the State

Educational Standards, the procedure of competition and the documents "Lecturer's workplace passport", by which the College is able to ensure that specialists with appropriate education will teach in the educational institution.

It is positive that job descriptions have been developed for some of the administrative and support staffs, which makes it possible to clearly define the functions of the positions and avoid repetitions, but there are a number of important positions in the job list, for example, Deputy Director for Academic Affairs, Head of the Educational Department, Deputy Director on Educational Activities, methodologist, internship (dual) instructor, internship manager, etc., for which there are no job descriptions.

The expert panel considers it positive that the College is trying to implement the mechanism of anonymous surveys for the evaluation of teaching staff, which is still imperfect, but in case of proper implementation and regular conducting, students will become direct participants in the processes of raising problems.

It is worrying that the class observations conducted for the evaluation of the teaching staff do not contain an evaluation element, thus they are not very effective as an evaluation tool when conducted in this way.

The expert panel considers it positive that the lecturers of TSRC regularly participate in the trainings organized by the National Centre for Vocational Education and Training Development and other structures, but the need of the lecturer is not assessed before the training. There were trainings for some professional modules, but few lecturers participated in them, there were no special professional trainings, which is an obstacle for improving the professional qualities of the teaching staff.

It is worrying that the main teaching staff does not have practical skills, but it is positive that as a result of dual APs they will have the opportunity to communicate with practitioners involved in the educational process, as a result of which the lecturers will have the opportunity to familiarize themselves with the requirements of employers and revise the subjects they teach accordingly.

Only one of the 43 lecturers of TSRC is an employer-teacher, but it is positive that in recent years there has been an increase in the number of young teachers who can lay the foundation for innovations, new methods, and ideas in the College. It is worrisome that TSRC does not have an employer-teacher involvement policy, as a result of which both the employer, the College, and the graduate will benefit.

The expert panel considers it positive that there are mechanisms of financial interest, awarding of honors, and verbal encouragement in TSRC (if financial resources are available), but the effectiveness of this process would increase even more if TSRC had clear criteria for evaluating the lecturer's work and the encouragement was based on that on criteria.

TSRC does not have the position of the Responsible for Internal Quality Assurance Center in its staff list, the coordination of the processes was carried out by the Deputy Director for Educational Affairs on a non-paid basis, which may hinder the effectiveness of combining two important positions, as well as cause a conflict of interests between these two positions.

Summary: Taking into consideration that TSRC has a policy for selecting teaching and support staffs, stable teaching and support staffs, certain defined requirements for professional activities, a policy for attracting young personnel, professional potential, therefore, the expert panel considers that TSRC meets the requirements of Criterion 5.

Conclusion: *The correspondence of the institutional capacities of TSRC to the requirements of Criterion 5 is satisfactory.*

VI. RESEARCH AND DEVELOPMENT

CRITERION: The Institution ensures the implementation of research activity and the link of the research with teaching and learning.

Facts: TSRC has not defined its ambitions in the field of research in any document, therefore, there is no long-term strategy and mid-term and short-term plans related to research activities.

There are no incentive mechanisms to involve teaching staff and student in research work.

Two lecturers of TSRC are the authors of professional manuals: "Technical Maintenance and Repair of Motor Vehicles", "Organization of Technical Inspection of Motor Vehicles and Indicators for Assessing the Technical Condition of Motor Vehicles", "Technological Equipment", "Production and Technological Processes of Motor Vehicle Repair" and "Mechanical Processing of Metals on Machine Tools and Lines: Turner" published by National Centre for Vocational Education and Training Development (MKUZAK). To develop these manuals, local best practices from the secondary vocational sector were studied and effectively implemented in the College. These are the only positive experiences of the College.

From the site-visit it became clear that 1 of the lecturers of the College participated in the processes of revision of the State Education Standards organized by MKUZAK, which implies the study of the sector and the experience of other countries.

TSRC does not have such a policy to assign the lecturer to study the international experience and development trends of his/her profession. Study of international experience as such is not carried out, except for one or two cases, which are individual initiatives of professors. The class observations showed that within the modules, students are given not so up-to-date learning materials that are not applicable today, for example, in the "Communication" module.

Studying the experience of specialists in their field during pre-graduate internships is considered as somewhat research activity for the students.

Diploma, course, individual and independent works, which would be aimed at the development of creative, analytical and critical thinking, are not carried out in TSRC.

It should also be noted that the assignments given to students within the framework of some modules of AP are aimed at developing research skills, for example, in the dual education program "Tourism" during practical training at the employer, students learn to create effective tour packages

by studying the market, consumer requirements, price policy etc., but such positive experiences are rare.

From the site-visit and the study of the assignments, it became clear that the assignments given to the students are mostly not research-based, the students do not study local and international professional literature, they do not try to find new work efficiency solutions within the profession. Students and professors are satisfied only with the study materials provided by the lecturer, there are no requirements for the student to study additional professional literature.

There are no employer-lecturer joint research programs, the College has not yet thought about such opportunities.

Considerations: TSRC has not defined its ambitions and goals in the field of research, the presence of which will promote the stable involvement of TSRC students and lecturers in research and creative works, will increase the attractiveness of the College. In order to involve the teaching staff and students in research work, there are no incentive mechanisms that would contribute to the interest and need of the latter to engage in research work.

The expert panel is concerned that the College does not value the presence and development of research skills among teaching staff and students, as evidenced by the nature of assignments given to students and the passivity of teaching staff in the field of research. The expert panel emphasizes the formation of research skills among students in the College, which will help the student, and later also the employee, to change correctly in time and find new solutions. Two lecturers of TSRC are authors of professional educational manuals, but it is worrying that such positive experiences are not disseminated and the College does not provide support in this matter. They are individual initiatives of lecturers.

The lecturers do not study the international experience and innovations of their field, so the modernity of teaching, learning methods and learning materials can be endangered. It is also worrisome that professors and students are limited only to study materials, which does not allow them to fully develop as specialists. If the assignments were research-based they would contribute to a better mastery of the professional field by the student and the use of the right sources of obtaining information, in addition, the student will develop the skills of independent work.

The expert panel considers positively the independent works carried out by students within the framework of dual practical classes at employers, but it is worrying that an important stakeholder, the employer, values the formation of research skills in his future employee, but the College does not respond and does not disseminate these positive experiences among the teaching staff.

Lecturer-employer joint research programs can foster to reveal employer's needs and contribute to the formation of research skills of lecturers and students, later on they can ensure additional financial inflow for the College.

Summary: Taking into account that research ambitions are not defined at TSRC, the formation of creative and analytical thinking is not encouraged, the research and educational processes are not fully interconnected, the study and dissemination of positive experience is not carried out, the expert panel finds that TSRC does not meet the requirements of Criterion 6.

Conclusion: The correspondence of the institutional capacities of TSRC to the requirements of Criterion 6 is unsatisfactory.

VII. INFRASTRUCTURE AND RESOURCES

CRITERION: The Institution has necessary resources to create learning environment and to effectively support the implementation of its stated mission and goals.

Facts: TSRC is located in town Ijevan of Tavush region, it has 1 building and occupies 4723.7sq.m. It has 304 students.

In the framework of the budgetary support program for secondary vocational education by the European Union, as well as by the "Anushavan and Ofik Abrahamyan Educational Foundation", TSRC received a rich material and technical base in accordance with the requirements of modern education: two computer laboratories, an interactive classroom, a language cabinet, sports equipment, first medical aid kit, culinary laboratory, laboratories of physics, mathematics, chemistry, winemaking with the latest equipment, musical and electronic equipment, hairdressing cabinet, needlework, soldering, locksmith and woodworking workshops, jewelry and "Armat" engineering laboratory with necessary cabinet furniture.

The College has a playground for football, volleyball and basketball. There is also a gym in the College next to the sports hall, which is equipped with necessary equipment,.

Within the framework of the grant received by the Armenian representative office of the "Save the Children" organization, a social enterprise "Technical Maintenance and Repair of Automobiles" was built, which is also a dual education environment for students of the relevant profession. With the support of "Freenergy" LLC, a solar photovoltaic plant-laboratory was built in the yard of the College. The College also has a student minibus, which is used to transport students outside the region within the framework of dual education programs.

TSRC also has a renovated dormitory area with two floors. From the site-visit and the observation of the resources it became clear that in the future the College intends to furnish one of these floors and turn it into a guest house. It is planned to use the guest house not only for ensuring new financial flows, but also for the development of professional skills of students of the "Tourism" profession.

TSRC has an internet connection in the computer rooms, which is used by both students and lecturers, most of the computer base of the College needs to be strengthened. During the site-visit, it became clear that "Anushavan and Ofik Abrahamyan Educational Foundation" is ready to support the College in this matter by providing new and more powerful computers.

From the observation of the resources it became clear that some of the laboratories, studios and equipment of the College are not fully utilized. The reason for the non-operation of the laboratory of chemistry is the lack of necessary materials, the non-operation of the social enterprise "Technical Maintenance and Repair of Automobiles" is related to the lack of a suitable specialist in the region, the non-operation of the jewelry and woodworking studios is due to the lack of relevant

teaching specialists and applicants. It should be stated that most of the resources are only didactic material for students.

There are no teaching specialists in the region in the specialty "Installation, Repair and Maintenance of Renewable Energy Power Plants" opened on the basis of the solar photovoltaic plant.

One of the strategic goals defined by the Concept of Development of TSRC is to create a modern learning and working environment equipped with technology to promote the effective functioning of all students and employees. From the meeting with the students, it became clear that the technologically equipped learning environment achieved by TSRC is partially accessible to the students, as there are not always adequate materials to conduct laboratory experiments and appropriate specialists to operate the complex equipment.

The management of the financial resources of the College is carried out on an annual basis and through the preparation of the budget estimate, and at the end of the year, the annual performance is prepared according to the current estimate. The College is financed from the RA budget and other funds not prohibited by law, according to the amount and allocations set by the founder. From the study of the documents, it became clear that in 2020, budgetary incomes made up 99.09%, extra-budgetary incomes - 0.91%, of which salaries were paid - 87.34%, payments to the state budget - 0.04%, scholarships - 6.86%. economic costs (including utility costs, office costs, general and capital repair costs) of 5.35% and service acquisition costs of 0.27% were also incurred.

The main goal of the improvement and reform of the financial policy of the College is to increase the allocations from the state budget through the increase in the number of students, as well as extra-budgetary funds from the tuition fees of students in the paid education system. In addition, the solar photovoltaic plant located in the yard of the College according to preliminary calculations produces 360,000 AMD worth of electricity per year which will enable the College to make savings at the end of year 2021 and spend the money saved on other strategic goals. In the future, an increase in extra-budgetary funds can also be provided by the launch of the hotel floor.

From the site-visit and the study of the documents, it was found out that the College gives importance to the involvement of additional financial income, for this purpose it considers short-term courses, participation in tenders, finding donors, using its educational and logistical base as the main means.

From the observation of the resources and the meeting with the stakeholders, it became clear that the College needs additional projectors, the existing ones are out of order.

TSRC also has a library and a book store, the library fund is not fully used, in the absence of a librarian, students cannot use books, there is a lack of modern professional literature in the library. There is also an archive in TSRC.

In 2021, TSRC developed the "Resource Allocation Procedure" and in 2020, the "Policy for the Operation, Planning, Management and Monitoring of the Institution in Accordance with the Financial Means" documents. According to the financial monitoring policy, the process of planning, management and monitoring of the activities of the College should guarantee the development of the College's activities, improvement of the evaluation process and ensuring the sustainability of the

development of the College. According to the "Resource Allocation Procedure", the goal of the College is to reduce the inefficient distribution of resources and to direct them in the most important strategic directions, in addition, the document contains a matrix of the distribution of competencies and a schematic presentation of the procedure according to the principle of input, process, output. The site-visit and meetings with the stakeholders showed that this procedure and policy is not applicable to the College, as it does not arise from the need of TSRC.

Admission is organized according to the number of licensing places allocated by the RA Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sports, therefore, sharp increases or decreases in resource needs, as a rule, do not occur, unless, of course, admission is carried out in an existing specialty.

The organization of document circulation and document management in the College, the circulation of internal and external documents, is carried out in accordance with the clerical rules. Internal document circulation is carried out in paper version.

Since 2013, the electronic system of external document circulation (Mulberry) has been operating at the College. The college has an official e-mail, but the feedback mechanisms are imperfect because they do not respond quickly. In 2017, the College acquired the automated AS-7-7.2.3 accounting software. The program made it possible to prepare accounting reports automatically. Through the program, the control system of fixed assets and material assets has become more efficient.

The College has health and safety infrastructures such as a security service and a medical unit on the first floor with necessary supplies and medicines. It became clear from the site-visit that the medical unit also implements preventive measures for pandemic, such as measuring the temperature and disinfection.

In order to increase the efficiency of the services aimed at maintaining security, a video system for internal control, a security sound system and a fire safety system were installed in the College.

Civil defence of students and employees in emergency situations is carried out by the Center for Civil Defence of TSRC. The teacher of military preparation is ex officio the Head of the Center.

The territory of the TSRC is fenced, there is a video control system for the entrance and yard, the entrance is also guarded by a guard. The entrance of the College has a ramp, emergency evacuation schemes are posted on all floors of the College, and there are fire extinguishers for fire safety. The College has day and night duty, for which a schedule is made, and at night, the security system is activated and the building is guarded by a night watchman. There is also an internal radio station at TSRC.

There are no bases for assessing satisfaction with resources in the College, no surveys are conducted for evaluating the educational environment, but from the site-visit it can be stated that the College is equipped with the material and technical base to organize the educational process. From the observation of resources, it also became clear that most of the resources are not used and are only as demonstration material for students, there are laboratories that have never worked since the day of their establishment, for example, jewelry, chemistry, car technical maintenance, winemaking (they

tried to squeeze grapes once recently), etc. The College has a Smart Whiteboard which has not been switched on or used since the date of purchase.

Considerations: The expert panel considers that, in general, the resources of the College ensure the implementation of educational programs in the current conditions. It is praiseworthy that the funds acquired through grant programs are also the basis for replenishment of resources in TSRC. It is positive that the College is able to find donor organizations, investors to replenish its resource base, but it is a concern that very often such resources are acquired that are not applicable to the College, because there is a problem of applicants and professionals, for example jewelry, woodworking, hairdressing, welding, car technical maintenance laboratories. This also indicates that the College does not identify needs when submitting a request.

The expert panel considers it positive that the building conditions of the College, the classrooms, laboratories and studios are sufficient for the full implementation of APs.

The expert panel emphasizes that the College strives to increase its extrabudget by using its own resources to implement additional short-term programs, through the use of the resource base, but it is worrying that no active steps are taken in this direction.

It is disturbing that a significant part of the material and technical resources of TSRC is not used in the educational environment, there are important equipments that never served their purpose, at best they were just displayed as a didactic tool.

The expert panel considers it positive that there is a mechanism for the distribution of financial resources in TSRC, which is based on the preparation of the annual budget estimate and the control of the budget execution. It is a matter of concern for the expert panel that in the estimate of the College money was mentioned for trainings, but no trainings were carried out.

It is worrisome that there are no grounds for evaluating satisfaction with resources in TSRC, no evaluation of the educational environment is carried out, which does not lead to highlighting the real needs of the stakeholders.

The expert panel considers it positive that the external document circulation is systematic, controlled by the Director, ensuring the uninterrupted operation of the College. It is important that all facilities are in place to ensure safe and secure environment in TSRC.

Summary: Taking into account that TSRC provides the necessary conditions for the implementation of the APs, invests efforts in the direction of acquiring resources, a safe and secure environment is created for the organization of the educational process, the expert panel finds that the College has the necessary resources for the establishment of an educational environment, fulfillment of the stated mission and objectives and meets the requirements of Criterion 7.

Conclusion: *The correspondence of the institutional capacities of TSRC to the requirements of Criterion 7 is satisfactory.*

VIII. SOCIETAL RESPONSIBILITY

CRITERION: The Institution is accountable to the government and society for the education it offers and the resources it uses as well as for the research it conducts.

Facts: One of the strategic objectives of TSRC is to ensure the transparency and publicity of the organization of educational process. A system of internal and external accountability has been formed to a certain extent in TSRC. The Director submits a report to the Governing Board, the Deputy Directors for academic and educational affairs report to the Director, and the departments report according to structural subordinations. From the study of the documents, it became clear that the reports of the divisions mainly present a description of the performed works, there are no analyses. The reports presented by the College Director lack information about the activities of other departments of the College, the report is mainly financial. The planning and reporting of TSRC not always fully reflect the priorities of the Concept of Development.

According to the self-analysis, during the year, in accordance with the procedure established by the law, TSRC submits reports also to the Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sports of the Republic of Armenia, the State Revenue Committee, the National Statistical Service and other state agencies. According to the self-analysis, the reports submitted to the authorized body include not only financial indicators, but also the movement of students and teaching staff, information about their qualification, work experience and the conducted courses, as well as admission results.

For the purpose of transparency of activities, TSRC has a Facebook page ("Tavush State Regional College"), where announcements are made about vacancies, admission and recruitment of applicants, as well as current events. The study of the Facebook page revealed that it is registered as an individual, with no means of contacting the College, such as phone, email, etc., listed. Feedback mechanisms are imperfect. The College does not have an official website, but during the site-visit the stakeholders mentioned that they intend to create a website. The Facebook page is managed by the Career Responsible, no analysis of the page's activity is carried out.

TSRC actively cooperates with employers in the region, establishes connections with various schools in the region, which are also feedback mechanisms for the College. To a certain extent, there are mechanisms for maintaining contact with society, but their effectiveness has not been assessed.

TSRC transfers knowledge to society by implementing short-term programs designed for different target groups. TSRC aims to implement short-term courses such as hairdressing, make-up, manicure, automotive, maintenance and repair of automobile internal combustion engines, needlework, cooking, etc.

The College implemented the three-month short-term course "Computer Operations", "Cooking" program in collaboration with Word Vision, etc., which provides additional financial inflow for the College.

Considerations: The expert panel considers it positive that a system of internal accountability has somewhat been implemented in the College, but it does not allow to get an image of the College

as a whole, because the work of all departments is not analyzed and presented in a unified form. Sectional reports, which are mainly descriptive, do not allow to understand the effectiveness of the work done by the College and to orient the next steps.

In the case of implementing the planning and reporting of the divisions according to the Concept of Development, TSRC will have the opportunity to monitor and evaluate the implementation of its goals and objectives, to bring out the existing good experience in various fields.

The expert panel highlights the fact that TSRC has a Facebook page through which it informs the public about itself, but the information published there is incomplete. There is a need to activate the Facebook page from the point of view of content updates.

The expert panel encourages that, in order to maintain feedback, the College works with employers and local schools to inform about itself and its opportunities.

It is praiseworthy that the College gives importance to the transfer of knowledge to the stakeholders and considers it as one of its strategic goals, but the steps taken in this direction are still passive, it is necessary to activate the works, which will lead to an increase in the role of TSRC and provision of new financial flows.

Summary: Taking into account that TSRC has a certain established system of internal and external accountability, mechanisms for providing feedback and transferring knowledge to the public, the expert panel finds that TSRC meets the requirements of Criterion 8.

Conclusion: *The correspondence of the institutional capacities of TSRC to the requirements of Criterion 8 is satisfactory.*

IX. EXTERNAL RELATIONS AND INTERNATIONALIZATION

CRITERION: The Institution promotes experience exchange and enhancement through its sound external relations practices, thus promoting internationalization of the Institution.

Facts: According to the Concept of Development of the College an objective has been set to activate relations with employers, involving them not only in the processes of developing educational programs, but also to use their opportunities more effectively. In order to solve this problem, TSRC signed a number of cooperation agreements with organizations and employers operating in the region, for example, "Ijevani BUAT" CJSC, "LASTIVER DESERT" JSC, UNDP "TAVUSH TOURISM DEVELOPMENT AND RESEARCH CENTER", "YSU Ijevan branch", etc. As a result of cooperation with employers, the students of the College have the opportunity to use the resource base of the employer, for example, in "Winemaking and Juice Production", "Tourism" and "Technical Maintenance and Repair of Motor Vehicles" professions.

The College is included in the program "Testing the Dual System in the VET Sector" implemented within the framework of the "Development of the Private Sector and Professional Education and Training in the South Caucasus" program of the German International Cooperation

Company (GIZ), within which it successfully implements 2 dual APs "Tourism" and "Technical Maintenance and Repair of Motor Vehicles" professions. Using the experience of the dual educational programs, TSRC began to cooperate with the Ijevan Wine and Brandy Factory to implement the "Winemaking and Juice Production" primary vocational educational program.

Since 2008, TSRC has been included in the list of 12 colleges provided by the budget support program of the European Union. This has enabled the College to acquire a rich logistical base over the years (more details are in Criterion 7).

The College does not have infrastructures for ensuring external cooperation and internationalization, but from the site-visit and meetings with stakeholders, it became clear that the College management, Career Center and Internship supervisors are actively working to expand the scope of external cooperation of the College based on the opportunities of the region.

As a result of the cooperation of the RA Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sports, the College and "Anushavan and Ofik Abrahamyaner Educational Foundation", the "Armat" engineering laboratory was opened in the College, as well as robotics, winemaking, jewelry, auto maintenance and a number of other laboratories and studios (more details are in Criterion 7). TSRC also cooperates with "Save the Children" organization, thanks to which it also acquired a laboratory.

In 2020 "Establishment of Low Carbon Energy Training Centers for Young Specialists" implemented with the co-financing of the College and the cooperation and support of the Ferti Charity Center NGO, the United Nations Development Program (UNDP), the Global Ecological Fund (GEF), the Small Grants Program (SGP), the center-laboratory of "Renewable Energy Sources and Energy-Efficient Technologies" was established in the College.

TSRC also cooperates with YSU Ijevan branch, the cooperation creates an opportunity for the graduates of the College to continue their studies at the university. In addition, university specialists cooperate with the College in the works of mutual agreement and processing of modular programs, providing methodological and professional assistance to organize the educational process more efficiently.

Exchange programs for teaching staff and students of the College have not yet been implemented, there are no joint training programs with foreign colleges. There are no mechanisms to increase the level of knowledge of foreign languages of the internal stakeholders in the College. Knowledge of foreign languages (mainly English) is limited to the knowledge of foreign language among the lecturers teaching a foreign language. Meetings with experts and lecturers confirmed that the teaching staff needs to increase the level of foreign language, the lecturers mostly know Russian.

Considerations: In its strategic plan, TSRC emphasizes cooperation with employers, which is encouraged by the expert panel from the point of view of forming external relations. The expert panel considers it positive that the College management uses all opportunities to create strong external relations and expand cooperation. The result is that the College is largely self-sufficient in terms of resources. It is worrisome that the established partnerships are based on personal contacts and not conditioned by institutional contacts, which may jeopardize their continuity in case of the change in management staff.

The College has wide opportunities for cooperation and in some professions there is also positive experience that can be disseminated for the improvement of other professions. The expert panel also highlights the fact that TSRC cooperates to some extent with other regional state colleges, but the possibilities of cooperation are not fully used.

It is also commendable that TSRC also conducts cooperation experiments with international partner organizations and gives a certain importance to the internationalization processes, besides, it is encouraged that within the framework of such programs the exchange of experience of specialists is also carried out.

The expert panel emphasizes the possibilities of internships gained as a result of cooperation and the implementation of joint educational programs with employers. Continuing its active works, the College later on will have the opportunity to provide its graduates not only with internships, but also with jobs in their specialty.

The expert panel emphasizes foreign language proficiency of the faculty and students, which will facilitate the exchange of experience with specialists from other countries and participation in international programs, the latter will also contribute to the acquisition of new financial resources.

Summary: Taking into account that TSRC in general encourages the exchange of experience and development through external relations, there is a positive experience of creating and strengthening external relations in TSRC, and the external relations contribute to the implementation of joint APs with employers, the expert panel considers that TSRC meets the requirements of Criterion 9.

Conclusion: *The correspondence of the institutional capacities of TSRC to the requirements of Criterion 9 is satisfactory.*

X. INTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE SYSTEM

CRITERION: The Institution has an internal quality assurance system, which promotes establishment of a quality culture and continuous improvement of all the processes of the Institution.

Facts: The document of "Quality Assurance Policy and Procedures", which was approved on 20.08.2020, is available in TSRC. In the mentioned document, the main steps aimed at the formation of the quality assurance system in the College are defined, all the processes that should contribute to the quality operation of the College are clearly presented, namely, annual monitoring and regular review of the APs, conduction of surveys among the external stakeholders regarding the graduates of the College, organization of meeting-discussions, implementation of programs to increase the qualification of teaching staff, etc.

There is no separate department in the College to carry out the internal quality assurance functions of the institution, although this infrastructure is indicated in the organizational structure of the College, and the position of the QA responsible can be provided to the College in case of demand. While coordinating the accreditation processes, the responsibilities of the IQA responsible were carried out by the Deputy Director for Academic Activities on a public basis. It became obvious from the site-visit that the functions of these two positions are interactive, there is a conflict of interests between the positions. As a result of the vacancy of the position of the IQA responsible at TSRC, planning and ongoing work in this direction were not carried out.

Within the framework of the accreditation processes, a self-analysis group was created at TSRC, which was formed by the Deputy Director for Academic Affairs, making the decision based on the previous experience of the members (in 2015, the College conducted a pilot self-analysis 2 within the framework of the 3rd and 5th criteria). One responsible person was appointed for each criterion, who performed the self-analysis of the given criterion. During the study of the self-analysis and the site-visit, it became clear that the selection of responsible persons was not justified in all cases, for example, the persons responsible for the "Mission and Goals", "Governance and Administration" criteria were persons who were not involved in the strategic planning and management processes. During the site-visit, it became clear that the self-analysis group did not have complete, numerical, reliable and analyzed data, neither students nor employers were involved in the group. The two employees trained for this purpose by ANQA were not involved in the process either.

It also became clear that since January 2022, the College is going to have a separate post of Quality responsible and there is already a candidate for that post.

Quality assurance processes take place to some extent at the Cycle Committee level in the form of class observations. An attempt has been made by the Career Center to conduct pilot surveys (more details are presented in criteria 2, 4, 7), but these are not applicable data yet. External stakeholders, such as employers and presidents of final attestation committees, are involved in some level of quality assurance, namely participating in final attestation processes and providing feedback on student preparation and achievement of outcomes. Employers also participate in the review and improvement of APs within the dual program framework.

During the site-visit, it became clear that certain facts and data collection functions are performed by the Career Center (data on graduate employment), but the data collection mechanisms are not specified and planned and the results are not analyzed.

Considerations: The expert panel positively assesses the fact that the College is trying to extract certain data through various departments, there is a regulatory document for quality assurance. The College has tried to develop the "Quality Assurance Policy and Procedures" document, but it is worrying that quality assurance processes are largely not organized and the implementation of the developed document and evaluation of its effectiveness is not carried out.

It is of concern for the expert panel that the internal Quality Assurance infrastructure is not adequately staffed, which leads to situational decision-making in TSRC.

The expert panel positively assesses that quality assurance processes are in place in the College to a certain extent, class observations are carried out, employers are involved in the review and final certification processes of dual APs, but data collection, analysis and dissemination of results do not take place fully, which may hinder creation of quality culture prerequisites and the extraction of good practices.

Summary: Taking into account that the quality assurance system is not implemented in TSRC, there is no adequate human resource, accordingly processes are not implemented or if they are implemented they are not complete, the expert panel finds that TSRC does not meet the requirements of Criterion 10.

Conclusion: *The correspondence of the institutional capacities of TSRC to the requirements of Criterion 10 is unsatisfactory.*

ASSESSMENT ACCORDING TO ACCREDITATION CRITERIA

CRITERION	CONCLUSION
1. Mission and Purposes	Satisfactory
2. Governance and Administration	Unsatisfactory
3. Academic Programs	Satisfactory
4. Students	Satisfactory
5. Faculty and Staff	Satisfactory
6. Research and Development	Unsatisfactory
7. Infrastructure and Resources	Satisfactory
8. Societal Responsibility	Satisfactory
9. External Relations and Internationalization	Satisfactory
10. Internal Quality Assurance System	Unsatisfactory



Kristine Hakobyan, Head of the expert panel

29.12.2021

APPENDIX 1. CVs OF EXPERT PANEL MEMBERS

Kristine Hakobyan- Graduated from Yerevan KH. Abovyan State Pedagogical University in 2004 with the profession of “Teaching in primary school”. In 2015 she graduated from the 5-month long distance courses of National Academy of Sciences on “Basics of Tourism”, “Etiquette and Intercultural communication”, “Human Resource Management”. She participated in the development of State Educational Standards and modular programs of “Organization of Service at Hotels and Tourist Complexes” (in 2011) and “Tourism (according to spheres)” (in 2020). She is an author of a number of manuals. Since 2005 she has been the Head of the Personnel Department and a lecturer of tourism at Kotayq State Regional College.

Alvina Nersisyan – Graduated from Yerevan State Linguistic University after Brusov in 2005 with the profession of “Russian Language and Literature”, in 2013-2018 she was a PhD student at the same university in the profession of “Pedagogy and Foreign Language Teaching Methodology”. In 2023 graduated from Stepanakert Mesrop Mashtots University with the profession of “Jurisprudence” (Criminal Law and Procedure). She is a lecturer at the Chair of Foreign Languages and the Head of the QA Center at Stepanakert Mesrop Mashtots University. She has participated in a number of local and international conferences, is an author of a number of articles.

Lianna Grigoryan – She graduated from Armenian State Engineering University in 1997 with the profession of “Mechanical production technology and equipment”. In 2020 graduated from Gyumri State Pedagogical Institute after M. Nalbandyan with the profession of Physics. Since 2011 she has been a lecturer at Artik State College.

Henrik Poghosyan- in 2009-2019 studied at School N1 in Artashat. Since 2019 he is a student at Ararat State Regional College in a profession of “Accounting”. IN 2020 he participated in the training for student experts organized within the framework of “Students’ Voice” project.

APPENDIX 2. TIME-SCHEDULE OF SITE-VISIT

18.10.2021-21.10.2021

N	18.10.2021	Launch	End	Duration
1.	Meeting with the Director of the College	10:00	11:00	60 minutes
2.	Meeting with the deputy-directors of the College	11:10	12:10	60 minutes
3.	Meeting with the self-evaluation working group (10-12 representatives)	12:20	13:00	40 minutes
4.	Meeting with the members of the Governing Board of the College	13:10	14:00	50 minutes
5.	Break, discussions of the expert panel	14:10	15:10	60 minutes
6.	Meeting with the alumni of the College (10-12 representatives)	15:20	16:20	60 minutes
7.	Meeting with the employers (10-12 representatives)	16:30	17:30	60 minutes
8.	Observation of documents, close meeting of the expert panel	17:40	19:00	100 minutes

N	19.10.2021	Launch	End	Duration
1.	Class observations	09:30	11:30	120 minutes
2.	Meeting with the heads of chairs	11:40	12:40	60 minutes
3.	Break, discussions of the expert panel	12:50	13:50	60 minutes
4.	Meeting with the representative of the teaching staff (including the 3 APs) (10-12 people)	14:00	15:00	60 minutes
5.	Meeting with the students (10-12 people)	15:10	16:10	60 minutes
6.	Meeting with the members of the Students' Council (10-12 people)	16:20	17:00	40 minutes
7.	Meeting with the heads of the departments of the College (Officer of the Personnel, Accountant, Responsible for Internship, Head of the dual internship, Chair assistant, Responsible for Career Center, Responsible for Security, Librarian)	17:10	18:10	60 minutes
8.	Observation of documents, close meeting of the expert panel	18:20	19:00	40 minutes

N	20.10.2021		Launch	End	Duration
1.	Meeting with the teaching staff and responsables of "Organization of Transportation and Transport Management" and "Technical Maintenance and Repair of Automobile Transport" professions (10-12 members)	Meeting with the the teaching staff and responsible of "Tourism" AP (10-12 members)	10:00	11:30	90 minutes
2.	Meeting with the students of "Organization of Transportation and Transport Management" and "Technical Maintenance and Repair of Automobile Transport" professions (10-12 members)	Meeting with the students of "Tourism" AP (10-12 members)	11:45	12:45	60 minutes
3.	Break, discussions of the expert panel	13:00	14:00		60 minutes
4.	Resource observation, visit to structural units	14:10	15:20		80 minutes
5.	Observation of documents, close meeting of the expert panel	15:30	19:00		210 minutes

N	21.10.2021	Launch	End	Duration
1.	Meeting with the QA responsible	09:30	10:30	60 minutes
2.	Open meeting with the expert panel	10:40	11:20	40 minutes
3.	Meeting with the staff selected by the expert panel	11:30	12:30	60 minutes
4.	Break, discussions of the expert panel	12:40	13:40	60 minutes
5.	Observation of documents, close meeting of the expert panel	13:50	16:00	140 minutes
6.	Meeting with the management of the College and summarization of the site-visit	16:10	16:30	20 minutes

APPENDIX 3. LIST OF THE DOCUMENTS OBSERVED

N.	Name of the document	Criterion
1.	2015–20 Strategic plan	1
2.	Working plans and reports of all the structural units and chairs /for the last 3 years/	2
3.	Regulations of HR department, Accounting Department, Education Department, Career Center, Library, Medical Center	2
4.	Minutes of the sessions of the Governing Board /for the last 3 years/	2
5.	Assignments given to students within the 3 academic programs	3
6.	Study material	3
7.	Work regulation or charter of chairs	
8.	Modular programs of the chosen 3 APs	3
9.	Sample of the minutes of Educational Methodical Council where it clearly mentions the decision made as a result of the discussion of the investment of any academic program and modular programs	3
10.	Sample of the minutes of Cyclic Committee on the decision made for the selection student centered methods of of teaching and learning processes	3
11.	Procedure of students' assessment	3
12.	Revised APs	3
13.	Internship programs for 3 APs	3
14.	Schedules of lessons	3
15.	Sheets of class observations	3
16.	Filled in diaries of internships (for the 3 selected academic programs per 3 examples for the last 3 years)	3
17.	Study materials given to students	3
18.	Plans and reports of Sc activities /for the last 2 years/	4
19.	Analyses and questionnaires of surveys conducted among the students	4
20.	Functions of the students' group instructor	4
21.	Sample of a circulation sheet	5
22.	Job descriptions	5
23.	Job descriptions of faculty and staff	5
24.	Training packages	5

25.	Portfolios of lecturers	5
26.	Minutes of the competition of lecturers	5
27.	Minutes of the Pedagogical Council	5
28.	Minutes of the Methodical Council	5
29.	Minutes of the cyclic committees	5
30.	Manuals authored by the lecturers	6
31.	Estimates for 2020, 2021	7
32.	Protocol on mutual agreement, processing of modular programs of cooperation with YSU branch	9

APPENDIX 4. RESOURCES OBSERVED

1. Library
2. Inventory
3. Cabinets (Psychology, students' group instructor, military preparation, solar energy, lingaphone, tourism and geography, jewelary, welding, plumbing)
4. Laboratories (Chemistry, Physics, "Armat", Computer, Culinary)
5. Studios (woodworking, technical maintenance of automobile transport)
6. Computer classrooms
7. Medical unit
8. Hall
9. Sports ground
10. Sports hall
11. Classrooms
12. Interactive classroom
13. Dormitory
14. Archive

APPENDIX 5. ORGANIZATIONAL STRUCTURE



APPENDIX 6. USED ABBREVIATIONS

1. TSRC–Tavush State Regional College
2. ANQA- National Center for Professional Education Quality Assurance
3. MESCS–Ministry of Education, Science, Culture and Sports
4. PET-professional education and training
5. GB-Governing Board
6. CoD-Concept of Development
7. NQF- National Qualifications Framework
8. SES-State Educational Standrads
9. MKUZAK- National Centre for Vocational Education and Training Development
10. AP-Academic Program
11. UNDP-United Nations Development Program
12. GEF-Global Ecological Fund
13. SGP- Small Grants Program
14. YSU-Yerevan State University
15. EU– European Union
16. IQA-Internal Quality Assurance